



## Belfast City Council

<b>Report to:</b>	<b>Strategic Policy and Resources Committee</b>
<b>Subject:</b>	<b>Appointment of Members From Lisburn and Castlereagh Councils to the Belfast Statutory Transition Committee (STC)</b>
<b>Date:</b>	22nd February, 2013
<b>Reporting Officer:</b>	Stephen McCrory, Democratic Services Manager (Ext 6314)

<b>1</b>	<b>Relevant Background Information</b>
1.1	The Belfast Statutory Transition Committee (STC) will comprise 25 members, 21 from Belfast City Council (i.e. the Members of the current VTC) with the remaining 4 Members coming from the existing Lisburn City and Castlereagh Borough Councils.
1.2	The Policy Proposals paper released recently by the Department of the Environment does not specify how these additional 4 Members should be appointed. Belfast City Council has previously adopted a position that those 4 Members should represent the areas of the existing Lisburn and Castlereagh Councils which will transfer to the Belfast Council area in 2015. The STC will be considering a range of investment and operational issues in the lead up to the formation of the new Council and it is recommended that the Council should write formally to the Department expressing the view that it is essential that the Members from Lisburn and Castlereagh are representative of the areas which will transfer.

<b>2</b>	<b>Key Issues</b>
2.1	It would seem to be reasonable that in appointing the representatives from Lisburn and Castlereagh a system of proportionality is employed to ensure fairness in the appointment process.

2.2 The main problem in trying to establish which representatives should be appointed is that the areas to transfer are based upon the new Ward boundaries as established by the Boundaries Commissioner in June 2009 whereas any analysis of the Party strengths on the Councils can only be based upon the 2011 local election results which were held on the basis of the existing (or old) ward boundaries. We are therefore not comparing like with like and are only making the best fit that is available to us.

2.3 **Lisburn City Council**

2.4 From the area of the existing **Lisburn City district**, the Commissioner recommended that the localities of Collin Glen, Poleglass, Lagmore, Twinbrook, Kilwee and Dunmurry should be incorporated in the Belfast district. The existing Dunmurry Cross District Electoral Area in Lisburn includes the wards: Collin Glen, Poleglass, Kilwee, Twinbrook, Dunmurry Seymour Hill and Derriaghy and therefore the existing Dunmurry Cross DEA appears to fit quite well with the area to transfer and that DEA has been used for the proportionality calculations.

2.5 The 2011 election results of the Dunmurry Cross DEA gave the following results:

SF	5
SDLP	1
DUP	1
Total	7

2.6 In calculating which of the parties should be allocated the 2 seats on the Belfast STC we use the formula:

$$\frac{\text{Number of members in the party elected in the DEA}}{\text{Total number of members elected in the DEA}} \times \text{number of seats on the STC}$$

This gives the following result:

SF	$5/7 \times 2 = 1.43$	1 rounded up to 2
SDLP	$1/7 \times 2 = 0.29$	0
DUP	$1/7 \times 2 = 0.29$	0

Therefore, Sinn Fein would be allocated both seats on the Belfast STC.

2.7 It would also be perfectly reasonable to base the decision on the use of the d'Hondt table of choices. If we use the d'Hondt table based upon the Dunmurry Cross DEA alone then the following result is achieved:

**Belfast STC - Seats from Lisburn using Dunmurry Cross DEA numbers**

	SF		SDLP		DUP
Divisor	(Choice)		(Choice)		(Choice)
1	5	1	1		1
2	2.500	2	0.500		0.500
3	1.667	3	0.333		0.333
4	1.250	4	0.250		0.250
5	1.000		0.200		0.200

2.8 **Castlereagh Borough Council**

2.9 From the area of the **existing Castlereagh district**, the Commissioner recommended that the localities of Tullycarnet, Gilnahirk, Braniel, Hillfoot, Merok, Cregagh, Wynchurch, Glencregagh, and Belvoir should be incorporated in the Belfast district

2.10 It is extremely difficult to identify an existing District Electoral Area in Castlereagh where these new localities are situated. The localities of Tullycarnet and Gilnahirk would seem to lie within the existing Castlereagh East DEA; the localities of Hillfoot, Glencregagh and Belvoir within the existing Castlereagh West DEA and the localities of Braniel, Merok, Cregagh and Wynchurch within the existing Castlereagh Central DEA. Therefore, the 2011 election results for the Castlereagh Central, East and West DEAs have been used to determine the party strengths in the area to transfer to Belfast in 2015. The results in those 3 DEAs were as follows:

DUP	9
ALL	5
UUP	2
SDLP	1
GREEN	1
Total	18

Again we use the formula:

Number of members in the party in the DEAs

x number of seats on the  
STC

\_\_\_\_\_

Total number of members elected in the DEAs

This gives the following result:

DUP	$9/18 \times 2 = 1.00$	1
ALL	$5/18 \times 2 = 0.56$	0 rounded up to 1
UUP	$2/18 \times 2 = 0.22$	0
SDLP	$1/18 \times 2 = 0.11$	0
GREEN	$1/18 \times 2 = 0.11$	0

2.11 Therefore both the DUP and Alliance parties would be allocated 1 seat each on the Belfast STC.

2.12 If we use the d'Hondt table of choices based upon the election results in 2011 for the Castlereagh Central, East and West DEAs then the following result is achieved:

**Belfast STC - seats from Castlereagh using Castlereagh Central, East and West DEA numbers**

	DUP		ALL		UUP		SDLP		GREEN	
Divisor	(Choice)		(Choice)		(Choice)		(Choice)		(Choice)	
1	9	1	5	2	2		1		1	
2	4.500	3	2.500		1.000		0.500		0.500	
3	3.000		1.667		0.667		0.333		0.333	

2.13 Therefore the DUP would have the first choice and the Alliance party the second choice. Again, each of the DUP and Alliance parties would be allocated 1 seat on the Belfast STC.

2.14 It is acknowledged that it could be argued that trying to fit the area to transfer from Castlereagh to Belfast is so imprecise that it would be better to base the decision on the overall political breakdown of the whole of the Castlereagh Council.

2.15 If we were to proceed on this basis then the political composition of Castlereagh Borough Council at the 2011 local elections was:

DUP	11
ALL	6
UUP	3
SDLP	2
GREEN	1
Total	23

If we base a decision on the overall political breakdown of the Council then we use the formula:

$$\frac{\text{Number of members in the party}}{\text{Total number of members}} \times \text{number of seats on the STC}$$

Total number of members

This gives the following result:

DUP	$11/23 \times 2 = 0.96$ rounded up to 1
ALL	$6/23 \times 2 = 0.52$ rounded up to 1
UUP	$3/23 \times 2 = 0.26$
SDLP	$2/23 \times 2 = 0.17$
GREEN	$1/23 \times 2 = 0.09$

2.16	Therefore, once again, both the DUP and Alliance parties would be allocated 1 seat each on the Belfast STC.																														
2.17	If we base the decision on the use of the d'Hondt table of choices for the Council as a whole the following result would be achieved:																														
<b>Belfast STC - seats from Castlereagh using whole Council numbers</b>																															
<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>DUP</th> <th>ALL</th> <th>UUP</th> <th>SDLP</th> <th>GREEN</th> </tr> <tr> <th>Divisor</th> <th>(Choice)</th> <th>(Choice)</th> <th>(Choice)</th> <th>(Choice)</th> <th>(Choice)</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>1</td> <td>11     1</td> <td>6     2</td> <td>3</td> <td>2</td> <td>1</td> </tr> <tr> <td>2</td> <td>5.500     3</td> <td>3.000     4</td> <td>1.500</td> <td>1.000</td> <td>0.500</td> </tr> <tr> <td>3</td> <td>3.667</td> <td>2.000</td> <td>1.000</td> <td>0.667</td> <td>0.333</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>			DUP	ALL	UUP	SDLP	GREEN	Divisor	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)	1	11     1	6     2	3	2	1	2	5.500     3	3.000     4	1.500	1.000	0.500	3	3.667	2.000	1.000	0.667	0.333
	DUP	ALL	UUP	SDLP	GREEN																										
Divisor	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)	(Choice)																										
1	11     1	6     2	3	2	1																										
2	5.500     3	3.000     4	1.500	1.000	0.500																										
3	3.667	2.000	1.000	0.667	0.333																										
2.18	Once again, the DUP would have the first choice and the Alliance party would have the second choice. Therefore, both the DUP and Alliance parties would be allocated a seat on the Belfast STC.																														
2.19	<p><b><u>Summary</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Belfast City Council would submit that the representatives from Lisburn and Castlereagh Councils to sit on the Belfast STC should be selected, on a proportional basis, from the areas of those Councils which will transfer to Belfast in 2015.</b></li> <li>• <b>In Lisburn, it would appear to be reasonable to use the election results in 2011 for the Dunmurry Cross DEA as the basis of determining the political party strengths in the area of that Council which will transfer to Belfast. On that basis, the representation from Lisburn should be 2 Members of Sinn Fein.</b></li> <li>• <b>In Castlereagh, there is not any comfortable fit between the area to transfer and the District Electoral Areas upon which the 2011 local elections were based. The area to transfer appears to include parts of the existing Castlereagh East, West and Central DEAs and therefore the combined results of those 3 DEAs have been used to determine the political party strengths in the area of that Council which will transfer to Belfast. Alternatively, as the fit is not a comfortable one, the political party strengths on the overall Council have also been used to determine the representation. Whichever scenario is used the result is the same; that the representation from Castlereagh should be 1 Member of the DUP and 1 Member of the Alliance Party.</b></li> </ul>																														

<b>3</b>	<b>Resource Implications</b>
3.1	None.

<b>4</b>	<b>Equality and Good Relations Implications</b>
4.1	None. The appointments to the Belfast STC would be based upon proportionality principles and would reflect the political representation from the areas of Lisburn and Castlereagh which will transfer to Belfast in 2015.

<b>5</b>	<b>Recommendations</b>
5.1	The Committee is recommended to adopt the position on the nomination of representatives from Lisburn City and Castlereagh Borough Councils to the Belfast STC as set out in the report i.e. that 2 Sinn Fein Members should be appointed from Lisburn and 1 DUP and 1 Alliance Member from Castlereagh.

<b>6</b>	<b>Decision Tracking</b>
Stephen McCrory, Democratic Services Manager March, 2013	

<b>7</b>	<b>Key to Abbreviations</b>
STC – Statutory Transition Committee VTC – Voluntary Transition Committee DEA – District Electoral Area	